

MADE

Museum and Art education for Deaf Empowerment

O1 - MADE Context Analysis

Transnational Report on Interesting Practices

Lead Partner:

TUCEP

Involved partners:

ANPEDA – AUSRU – DeafStudio – equalizent – EQUAL Ireland – Pitagoras – Pragma Engineering

This project has been funded with support from the European Commission.

This publication reflects the views only of the author, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein



Table of contents

1. INTRODUCTION	3
2. CONTEXT ANALYSIS IMPLEMENTATION AND METHODOLOGIES.....	4
3. OVERVIEW OF SELECTED INTERESTING PRACTICES.....	6
FROM AUSTRIA.....	6
FROM IRELAND	11
FROM ITALY	16
FROM POLAND.....	21
FROM ROMANIA	24
FROM SLOVAKIA	29
4. MAIN FINDINGS.....	34
4.1 Main strengths and weaknesses.....	34
4.2 Summary of competences about art disciplines and communication skills...	35
4.3 The innovative approaches to engage Deaf youth in art training.....	36
5. CONCLUSIONS	38



1. INTRODUCTION

The first Intellectual Output is aimed at collecting and benchmarking good practices in 6 partner countries (Austria, Ireland, Italy, Poland, Romania, Slovakia) about learning experiences based on art and visual languages addressed to Deaf people already implemented in each country. The analysis allows the partnership to better understand the content, methodologies and approaches to be developed within MADE project in order to enable Deaf youth to learn about art and become museum guides.

Through the analysis of selected practices, the partnership monitored the effects of these methodologies on the development by Deaf youth of competences in art disciplines, interpretation of art works and communication skills.

The results from the context analysis carried out at transnational level will represent the first contribution to the development of the MADE educational model, a tailor-made training programme aimed at empowering Deaf youth, facilitating their inclusion and the development of their communication skills, in order to create new working opportunities for them in the fields of art and culture.



2. CONTEXT ANALYSIS IMPLEMENTATION AND METHODOLOGIES

The process for the elaboration of the transnational report followed the tasks set out below:

✓ **Defining the research framework**

A common template for collecting the practices was shared among partners, including selection criteria, approaches and methodologies for every interesting practice included, as well as the effects of each practice on the development of competences about art disciplines, communication skills and interpretation of art works by Deaf youth.

✓ **Collection of practices**

Each national team collected at least five interesting practices, selecting, analysing and commenting on them. Partners with the opportunity to submit interesting practices from other European countries, which are not involved in the MADE project, were invited to include them in the analysis.

✓ **National Report**

Each national team summarised the interesting practices collected in a national report according to the common template provided by the lead partner (TUCEP). The national report was translated into English from the national languages so as to allow the transnational exchange of the practices collected and so promote their transferability across Europe.

✓ **Elaboration of the Transnational Report**

TUCEP, as lead partner, gathered all national reports in the form of a transnational report, presenting the general conclusions and a summary of the results at European level. After sharing the draft of transnational report among the partners in order to collecting their feedback and suggestions for improvement, the transnational report has been produced.

An executive summary of the transnational report will be prepared and translated into national languages and national sign languages (through video) so as to promote and disseminate the results of the analysis to a wider audience, through the project website and partners networks, presentation during Stakeholder Forum, Multiplier Events and any other dissemination events organised through the partnership.



The following criteria formed the basis for the selection of interesting practices:

- *Territoriality*: the practice has been implemented, or is currently being developed in one of the 28 EU member states;
- *Content*: the practice has to concern the implementation of art/visual languages education and museum' services addressed to Deaf people, with reference to practices that helped them to learn about art;
- *Innovation*: the practice can present new approaches or methodologies in order to help Deaf people to learn about art;
- *Impact*: the practice is interesting if it has an impact on the development of competences about art disciplines, interpretation of art works and communication skills by Deaf youth;
- *Target group*: the practice has to focus on Deaf people, facilitating their active and direct participation in the activities;
- *Effectiveness*: the practice has to demonstrate the achievement of results in relation to the objectives and expected impact, in terms of activities carried out, involved participants, type of developed competences, stakeholders reached;
- *Dissemination* of the practice among different institutions, associations and organisations.

The criteria followed by the partners for the selection of the museums to be included in this report were the quality of services offered, the success and take up in Deaf communities, networking with Deaf associations, and the sustainability of these services.

Some good practices, which were not fully consistent with all the outlined criteria, have nevertheless been included in the analysis because of their relevance at national or European level.

The collection and selection of interesting practices were conducted as follows:

- desk research based on internet literature
- interviews conducted among Deaf associations/schools, trainers/teachers; VET providers
- collection of information from Deaf people who experienced art/visual education learning, with reference to art education
- projects in which partners have been directly involved.



3. OVERVIEW OF SELECTED INTERESTING PRACTICES

An overview of the results from context analysis carried out in the partner countries is presented below. For each country, a short introduction shows the main objectives, methodologies and difficulties met during the process of collecting interesting practices. A total number of 30 good practices were selected by the partnership and for each of them the following items were summarised: brief description; implemented activities and final outcomes; approaches and methodologies; target groups; duration.

FROM AUSTRIA

At the beginning of the context analysis, desk research on the museums offering services for Deaf people in Austrian Sign Language (ÖGS) was carried out. Through this research, 22 museums were identified as catering to a Deaf audience, of which four had already cooperated with equalizent or partner organisation SignTime to make their service and exhibitions more Deaf-friendly.

The 22 museums can be subdivided into three groups according to what kind of services they offer for Deaf people. These are:

- 1) Museums with video guides in Sign Language (ÖGS and International Sign or IS);
- 2) Museums with guided tours with Sign Language interpretation;
- 3) Museums that offer both video guides in Sign Language and tours with Sign Language interpretation.

The desk research showed that most museums only have very little information about their services for Deaf people in Sign Language available on their website. Moreover, if there is information online, it is often difficult to find and incomplete. Most of the museums contacted showed a high level of interest in increasing their services for Deaf people in general and wanted to be updated about the progress of the MADE project. Some were even open to the possibility of being further involved in the project.



1) LENTOS KUNSTMUSEUM LINZ

Brief description

The museum offers a mobile guide with videos in ÖGS and once a month a guided tour with ÖGS interpretation to temporary exhibitions.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

Since 2014, a monthly 1-hour guided tour of the temporary exhibitions with ÖGS interpretation takes place. The free tours are promoted in the Deaf community, well-known and popular. No pre-registration is necessary. Before and after the tour, visitors stay in the museum to socialise. There is also a mobile guide with videos in ÖGS.

Approaches and methodologies

The concept for the guided tours was co-developed by an ÖGS interpreter who is also an art mediator. The tours are offered for changing temporary exhibitions and are prepared together by an art mediator and an interpreter. The tours are carried out with a dialogical approach.

Target group

Deaf people.

Duration

The guides tour last one hour.

2) TIROLER LANDESMUSEUM

Brief description

The museum offers a video guide available in ÖGS and International Sign (IS) as well as inclusive guided tours for Deaf and hearing visitors.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

The museum offers a free of charge video guide available in ÖGS and IS. It covers 42 exhibits (stations) and lasts about 90 minutes. 3 times a year inclusive guided tours for hearing and Deaf visitors with a Sign Language interpreter take place and cover changing topics.



Approaches and methodologies

Guided tours are organised in cooperation with the Counselling Centre for the Deaf and the Interpreting Centre. The video guide includes a map of Tyrol, which introduces cultural institutions that provide services in ÖGS.

Target group

Deaf people.

Duration

The video guide lasts about 90 minutes.

3) MUSEUM ARBEITSWELT (WORLD OF WORK)

Brief description

There are video guides available in ÖGS. Themed guided tours in ÖGS are scheduled approximately every three months or can be booked on request.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

Exhibition videos in ÖGS have been available free of charge since 2018. They can be accessed via the website and via the app. Special themed guided tours with ÖGS interpretation are scheduled approximately every three months and advertised within the Deaf community. Additional tours can be booked on request. Since ÖGS was introduced, the number of Deaf visitors has increased.

Approaches and methodologies

Relevant communities and disabled persons organisations (DPOs) were consulted and included in the planning and implementation of the exhibition. Close contact to Deaf associations and Deaf communities was developed and there is a cooperation concerning the promotion of guided tours.

Target group

Deaf people.

Duration

There are eight videos available in ÖGS, lasting approximately 35 minutes in total. Guides tours last between 1 and 1.5 hours.



4) LOWER AUSTRIAN MUSEUM OF HISTORY AND NATURE

Brief description

The museum's highlights are described in an app in ÖGS. Guided tours with interpretation in ÖGS can be booked in advance.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

Since 2014, an app with videos in ÖGS can be downloaded to visitors' mobile devices and used from anywhere. Guided tours with translation in ÖGS can be booked in advance. In cooperation with the Deaf Association of Lower Austria, a family day took place in 2018 with particular focus on Deaf children and parents. The museum receives consistently positive feedback from Deaf visitors.

Approaches and methodologies

When the app is used in the museum, it vibrates when the visitor is near the relevant exhibit. The app contains 11 videos relating to the history section of the museum and 11 videos relating to the natural history section as well as a quiz with videos in ÖGS.

Target group

Deaf people.

Duration

There are videos for 22 exhibits. Guided tours last about 1 hour.

5) OBERES BELVEDERE (UPPER BELVEDERE)

Brief description

The museum offers guided tours with ÖGS interpretation on request. A video guide with 30 videos in ÖGS can be borrowed.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

A video guide with 30 ÖGS videos is available. Guided tours with ÖGS interpretation can be booked on request. The multimedia guide is also used by people who are not Deaf, thereby sensitising them to the need, how to make art accessible for all.

Approaches and methodologies

Besides the ÖGS videos and guided tours with interpretation, several dimensions of accessibility are combined, because as well as ÖGS resources, easy reading format / language is provided.



Target group

Deaf people.

Duration

The video guide contains 30 videos in ÖGS.



FROM IRELAND

The Irish desk research looked at 5 examples of interaction of people and organisations in the context of Art Appreciation with a view to identifying practices which enabled or supported people with hearing disabilities to better engage with art and culture.

Three main approaches have been discovered:

1. *Education*

Trinity College Dublin Bachelor of Arts Honours Degree in Deaf Studies

Dublin City University Bachelor of Education (Irish Sign Language)

2. *Display*

National Gallery of Ireland - Guided Tours specially designed for people with hearing disabilities

Arts & Disability Ireland (ADI) – engage with Artists, Venues and Organisations to make Art more accessible to people with hearing disabilities

3. *Service Provision*

Deaf Village Ireland providing religious, community, sports, heritage and educational facilities for both Deaf and hearing people.

1) Arts & Disability Ireland (ADI)

Brief description

It is the national development and resource organisation for arts and disability, which promotes engagement with the arts at all levels – as professional artists, audience members and arts workers – for people of all ages with disabilities of all kinds.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

A range of services are provided to assist and encourage arts venues to adopt an inclusive approach to audience development in terms of infrastructure, marketing and programming. Services addressed to Deaf people are: interpretation in Irish Sign Language; Speech to text, a process of verbatim computer-aided transcription for deaf people; Induction loops and infrared systems enable people with hearing aids to receive amplified sounds from within a specific area directly into their hearing device.



Approaches and methodologies

Services to assist arts venues to adopt approaches and methodologies suitable for different type of disabilities: Deaf, hard of hearing, blind, visually impaired, Autism spectrum condition, sensory and communication disorders, learning disabilities.

Target group

Organisations and individual who have an involvement in Art or its display.

Duration

Variable.

2) NATIONAL GALLERY OF IRELAND

Brief description

Gallery tours for people who are Deaf or hard of hearing, led by guides trained in Sign Language, while hearing induction loops can be fitted at the information desks, the lecture theatre and gallery shop if needed. For hard-of-hearing people that prefer to explore the gallery without a tour guide, free audio guides with adjustable volume controls are available from the information desk.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

Guided tours in Sign Language for Deaf people and listening devices for hard-of-hearing people used for increasing enjoyment and engagement with the reopened gallery and the national collection.

Approaches and methodologies

Services addressed to Deaf and hard-of-hearing people in order to inspire, encourage and support learning through art in a positive and inclusive environment.

Target group

Deaf and hard-of-hearing people.

Duration

Variable.



3) DEAF VILLAGE IRELAND

Brief description

It is an inclusive state of the art social, administration, religious, community, sports, heritage and educational complex providing a range of facilities for both Deaf and hearing people. It is a collaborative organisation represented by all Deaf organisations in Dublin.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

Learning paths in Visual Merchandising & Display In DIT and Art & Crafts Professional Practice in Liberties College, addressed to Deaf people aimed at training them in art education.

Approaches and methodologies

Recognise and encourage the use of Irish Sign Language. Respect the different ethos's and abilities in the community. Empower, educate and show living example of Deaf Awareness. Share knowledge and skills to empower Deaf and Hearing people.

Target group

Deaf people living in Dublin.

Duration

Variable.

4) Trinity College Dublin Deaf Studies

Brief description

It provides the opportunity to develop insights into, and genuine appreciation for the culture, contributions, and contemporary issues related to Deaf people in Ireland and worldwide including Art and Culture. The undergraduate programme is the only one of its kind in Ireland and the Irish Sign Language (ISL) is the working language at the Centre for Deaf Studies. The multi-disciplinary approach to studies is led by a strong academic team, many of whom are Deaf.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

Across the four years of the degree students participate in field experiences, enabling them to put into practice knowledge gained through academic courses. Competence in Irish Sign Language is fundamental to gaining an in-depth understanding of the



Deaf community, and is a requirement of the programme. The Final outcome is a Bachelor of Arts Honours Degree in Deaf Studies.

Approaches and methodologies

Theoretical Component: Theoretical courses deal with linguistics, sociolinguistics, social policy, and social studies. Each theoretical course involves two hours of lecture time per week plus an expectation of self-study.

Assessment: The course employs a wide range of teaching, learning and assessment strategies. Both continuous assessment and end-of-semester exams are undertaken across the four years. The range and diversity of assessment formats account for varying student learning styles.

Target group

Hearing, Deaf or hard of hearing people who wish Study Irish Sign Language (ISL), Deaf culture and aspects of the Deaf community.

Duration

4 years.

5) DUBLIN CITY UNIVERSITY Bachelor of Education (Irish Sign Language)

Brief description

The Bachelor of Education (ISL) prepares students for a career as a Primary School Teacher in the Deaf education sector aimed at developing their capacity to fully interact with the education of Deaf students across all aspects of the curriculum including Art and Culture.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

The courses help students to cover the basics needed for teaching. They will come to understand how children think and learn in active ways. The curriculum courses will prepare students to teach all the subjects of the primary curriculum including Art and Culture using approaches that develop children's understanding and motivation.

Approaches and methodologies

Lessons in the school and placements in the school where the student will be supported by both faculty and school staff.

Target group

Deaf or hard of hearing people.



Duration

4 years.



FROM ITALY

The selection of interesting practices from Italy was implemented through desk research based on internet literature and interviews conducted among Deaf associations active in the cultural field.

There are not many details on the number of Italian museums offering services addressed to Deaf people. Thanks to a web portal promoted by the ENS (National Deaf people Body), it was possible to map the Italian museums offering this kind of service: more than 100 museums and about 800 Deaf visitors used the portal to date.

Although in recent times, the awareness of issues relating to accessibility for Deaf people in the field of culture areas has increased, as well as projects, funded by private individuals, associations and local authorities, most of these initiatives are poorly promoted and, therefore, not easily accessible to the Deaf public, who often remain unaware of them.

Moreover, such projects are often characterised by different models based on the territory/region in which they are implemented, creating a fragmented situation at national level.

1) MAPS Project: Musei Accessibili per le Persone Sorde

Brief description

The project objectives are mapping all the museums in Italy that offer services to Deaf people through video in Italian Sign Language (LIS) and, at the same time, training courses for Deaf people who are interested to become museum mediators in support of Deaf users.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

The project foresees 3 different activities:

- PORTAL: development of multimedia web portal accessible to Deaf people, both Italian and foreign, with a map of museum resources, archaeological sites, institutes and places of culture that have created routes accessible to Deaf people.
- TRAINING: organisation of courses in all Italian regions, addressed to Deaf young people under 35 on topics related to cultural heritage and its territory, aimed at acquiring the skills and techniques necessary to be museum mediators in support of Deaf users.



- Creation of VIDEOS in LIS to be uploaded in the portal available for Deaf visitors.

Approaches and methodologies

Lessons and workshops in museum accessibility targeted at young Deaf people held in museum settings.

Target group

Deaf people interested in becoming regional tutors/referents for MAPS project. Deaf visitors.

Duration

Lessons and workshops lasting 2 days in every Italian region.

2) FRAME Project “FRee Access for Multisensory Experience” at Pinacoteca Palazzo d’Errico (Potenza)

Brief description

The project develops sensory paths through the videos in LIS and predisposition of touch panels for management of multimedia contents, interactive and intuitive website.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

Creation of videos in LIS that explain the stories of each single art work; presence of LIS interpreter on request for guided tours; installation of touch panels for the management of multimedia contents interactive and intuitive website for people with sensory disabilities (included Deaf people) aimed at giving the opportunity to enjoy pleasant, relaxing and constructive cultural experience.

Approaches and methodologies

Videos in LIS – Presence of LIS interpreters on request.

Target group

Deaf visitors.

Duration

The services started in March 2019 and is currently in progress.



3) Museum Stories - Itineraries for Deaf and hearing people in The Galleria Borghese (Rome)

Brief description

The project is a museum experience designed specifically for Deaf and hearing people together, realised simultaneously in both Italian and LIS, to give everyone the opportunity, at the same time, to admire the art works housed in Galleria Borghese.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

The project includes scheduled meetings during which two guides (one Deaf and one hearing), simultaneously in Sign Language for the Deaf visitors and in Italian for the hearing visitors, explain the stories, secrets and details of the sculptures. The group of visitors is limited in number to allow for better interaction between visitors and guide, as well as for reasons of understanding.

Approaches and methodologies

Guided tours in LIS and in Italian language that allow the integration of Deaf and hearing cultures.

Target group

Deaf and hearing visitors.

Duration

One guided tour per month, from June 2019 until now.

4) The Blank Educational LISten project

Brief description

The project carried out by the experts of The Blank Network is aimed at increasing the accessibility and inclusion of Deaf people to the cultural agenda that the network proposes, encouraging employability of Deaf young people in the cultural sector through the setting up of a staff of mediators qualified in the field of contemporary art and art education.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

Implementation of training course related to art, heritage education and cultural mediation addressed to Deaf and hearing young people that know LIS. The course includes 6-days training in some of the major Italian institutions dedicated to modern



and contemporary art. The training contents are about different museum heritages, educational and accessibility methodologies and projects developed by the different institutions, the correct use of artistic terms in LIS. At the end of the course, the trained people participate in the exhibitions and events proposed by The Blank opened to hearing and Deaf visitors.

Approaches and methodologies

Meetings led by professionals in the museum scenario. Practical training carried out in the field through participation in the design of training activities that take place in museums.

Target group

Deaf and hearing people interested in becoming museum mediators. Deaf visitors as the main users of the museum mediation service.

Duration

The training lasts 6 months including 6 face-to-face meetings and experimentation of training in museum scenario.

5) Accessibility project- Cultural itineraries for Deaf and Deaf-blind people

Brief description

The project is aimed at fostering the participation of Deaf and Deaf-blind people in cultural and social life through the organisation of a series of accessible itineraries in selected Italian villages and multicultural visits to the main Italian cities with guided tours in LIS.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

An app has been created to allow visitors to make a virtual trip, by using smartphones, accessible to Deaf people aimed at exploring the heritage of history, culture, environment and traditions of some of the most beautiful villages in Italy. A series of accessible itineraries with guided tours in LIS and educational activities for children has been organised.

Approaches and methodologies

The project provides for the presence of a cultural mediator who explains, directly in LIS and LIS tactile for Deaf-blind people, the characteristics and history of the villages



that are visited. Within the project, workshops and activities have been organised with the direct involvement of Deaf visitors.

Target group

Deaf and Deaf-blind visitors.

Duration

From January 2019 until February 2020 in all Italian regions.

6) Museo Sannitico Deaf Experience

Brief description

It is a so-called “Deaf experience” installation inside the museum, which is interesting for hearing and Deaf visitors alike. The idea is to offer an experience that could be exploited by majority of visitors, without targeting the user of each installation. This is a direct application of UD principles in this framework: the itinerary/installations are open to all, hence showing target purposely thought solutions.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

Deaf experience is based on storytelling about the evolution of metal manufacturing in the Bronze Age. It presents a large screen displaying a progressive drawing technique to show a “story” about bronze alloy discovery. The drawing is associated with small self-explanatory scripts that presents the story without the use of a person or voice who explains. So, the story is presented to Deaf and hearing communities without any specific modification.

Approaches and methodologies

The choice of the progressive drawing allows a good understanding and usability of the result. After the presentations, user evaluations were made using a purposely conceived questionnaire.

Target group

Deaf and hearing visitors.

Duration

From November 2018 till now.



FROM POLAND

The context analysis carried out in Poland highlights Deaf people's limited access to topics devoted to art or work as a museum guide, despite increasing efforts to integrate them in society.

The research on good practices in Poland was based primarily on the following objectives:

- Increasing the availability of cultural resources for Deaf people by providing film tours of museums and making descriptions of individual props / exhibits from their resources available on the dedicated YouTube channel in Polish Sign Language.
- Increasing the knowledge of Deaf people about Polish culture, history and science by placing a translation into Sign Language of descriptions of museum props / exhibits on the YouTube channel.
- Developing interest in art and culture in the Deaf community through workshops and tours in PJM (Polish Sign Language) in the most important cultural institutions.

Some difficulties have been faced due to the lack of relevant materials found online. They are usually short descriptions of seminars or events related to Deaf art exhibitions, but there is a lack of extensive information on the implementation of projects for them. In addition, other NGOs are reluctant to provide accurate information relating to ongoing projects, fearing duplication of their activities by other organisations.

- 1) **Making museum resources accessible to Deaf people – I edition**
- 2) **Making museum resources accessible to Deaf people – II edition**

Brief description

The projects are innovative; the first Polish activities enabling Deaf people to fully use the resources of selected museums. Thanks to the most popular Polish internet television provider for Deaf people, it was possible to broadcast a series of trips around three Polish museums selected by Deaf people as part of an online plebiscite. The explanations given by the museum guide about the exhibitions were understandable, thanks to translation into Sign Language.



Implemented activities and final outcomes

Short videos of individual exhibits have been made available on YouTube. Descriptions in Sign Language are available after scanning the QR code. It is enough for a Deaf person to take a laptop, tablet or smartphone with Internet access to the museum.

Approaches and methodologies

Conduction of a plebiscite for the selection of the Museums where the movies have been recorded. The video clips describing artworks have been produced in Sign Language. The support of local cultural institutions had an impact not only on the availability of these facilities for the Deaf but also played an educational role for able-bodied people about the needs of accessibility for the Deaf people.

Target group

Deaf people from all over Poland; coordinators, presidents and representatives of NGOs acting for the benefit of Deaf people; museums in Poland where the films were recorded.

Duration

Project: „*Making museum resources accessible to Deaf people*” I edition (01.06.2015 – 31.10.2015); II edition” (01.03.2016 – 31.10.2016).

3) Making resources of the District Museum in Tarnów available to the Deaf

Brief description

The project means in turn enabling Deaf people to take the District Museum in Tarnów up on an offer. As part of the project, the largest internet television provider for the Deaf in Poland, broadcasted a series of two trips around the branches of this museum. The information provided by the guide has been fully translated into Polish Sign Language, which makes the films understandable for Deaf people.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

Recording of film materials with QR codes available in several Polish museums. A film team composed of translators, a cameraperson and volunteers were involved in recording the film materials. The tour guide at the Museum was not shown in the camera, only the translator, which allowed the Deaf person to focus on the provided information and pay attention to the exhibit. Such a formula turned out to be practical, as the films created are not intended to replace a visit to the Museum, but



only to show the value and attractiveness of the exhibition, encouraging to Deaf visitors to familiarise themselves with the cultural offer in the first person.

Approaches and methodologies

After recording all the materials, USB flash drives have been prepared including a recorded excursion programme and sent to nine institutions, including a school for the Deaf in Tarnów and NGOs operating for the benefit of the disabled and Deaf people. Information about the project was disseminated through the cooperating institutions.

Target group

Deaf people.

Duration

01.07.2016 – 30.11.2016

Other interesting initiatives aimed at allowing Deaf people to be involved in the cultural field are the following:

4) Culture exceeds for sound limit

The implementation of this project has contributed to breaking the cultural barrier between the World of Silence and the World of Sounds, which exists mainly in our heads and our stereotypes. Deaf people cannot learn only the subtleties of musical and vocal art. Any other visual work is just as accessible to them as to hearing people.

5) Encyclopaedia of Art in Polish Sign Language

The project is aimed at Deaf people using PJM. It is created based on the Lexicon of the Deaf Artists Group in cooperation with GAG. Whereas GAG (Deaf Artists Group) - is an informal group, an artistic group gathering of about 20 art enthusiasts - Deaf and hard of hearing artists who share a common passion and life in the World of Silence. They share a love of art, similar artistic thinking and a desire to cooperate with each other, pursue a common passion, which is art, understood as the search for their own consistent language of art.



FROM ROMANIA

The main objectives of the context analysis carried out in Romania include:

- empowering young Deaf people in different activities in artistic field including description of museum work arts in Sign Language, developing psychomotor skills, communication and relationship abilities in Deaf children through artistic workshops;
- amplification of the museum interaction with the Deaf public and aligning its services to good practice in the domain,
- helping Deaf youngsters to integrate more in the community and in the working market, showing that Deaf youngsters are able to work and be part of the big world, having a lot of abilities and talents;
- preventing social marginalization and promote values of civic society through improving levels of participation in adult learning, development of communication and expression skills through painting, developing the interpersonal communication skills of hearing and speech impaired young people through art therapy in the perspective of increasing the chances of social inclusion.

In Romania more than 5 good practices were found but the most important criteria taken into consideration was the quality of impact on Deaf community. The difficulties of the process included poor description of some projects, lack of results well organised, very few visual dissemination for a better overview of the projects.

1) “ARTmobile – A museum at Your fingertips!”

Brief description

It is the first time when a museum of art in Romania offers to all interested a wide range of products complementary during the visits. Some of the works have been made able both for hearing impaired and blind people through videos in Romanian Sign Language and tactile diagrams complemented by text and audio descriptions.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

The 40 selected works benefit from audio descriptions made by known voices in Romania. In addition, to support people with hearing deficiencies, 17 of these works are written in Sign Language by secondary school students and certified interpreters. For the visually impaired, 15 dramatic scenes similar to small theatre scenes were created and 14 works have tactile diagrams that are complemented by text and audio



descriptions that allow guided exploration. All of these materials can be downloaded for free at home, at school, or by interested associations.

Approaches and methodologies

The ARTmobile project is generically named "A Museum at Your fingertips " and has as propose a new approach to museum experience and the virtual visit of valuable works from collections of the largest museum in the country. Making the art accessible for Deaf by using Sign Language to describe exposed works.

Target group

Deaf and blind people

Duration

1 year (Nov 2016 - Nov2017)

2) "Sunetul Lutului" – The Sound of Clay

Brief description

The project was developed by IGO "Hear life" and the Special Technological High School "Vasile Pavelcu" - Iasi, with the support of MOL Romania and the Community Foundation. Through this project a pottery workshop was set up at Special Technological High School "Vasile Pavelcu" and over 300, mostly hearing-impaired, children have art-therapy activities under the direct guidance of over 30 volunteering high school teachers.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

The artistic activities included moulding the clay, painting the objects resulted, working at the pottery wheel. From the two years of the project, the first was dedicated to implementing activities only with Deaf pupils and in the second year the activities were held in collaboration with hearing pupils to empower Deaf children who became co-teachers in the workshop' activities. Outcomes: A pottery workshop still available today for over 300 pupils from special school and other pupils visiting from mainstream schools.

Approaches and methodologies

The main method of art therapy used in this project is pottery as an artistic way of expressing a craftsmanship with tradition in Romania and as an innovative method for



promoting cultural inspiration in young Deaf students. At a time when a particular emphasis is placed on computerised technologies, we aim to return to the knowledge of one of the traditional occupations of the Romanian people, namely pottery.

Target group

Children with hearing impairments, parents of children included in the project, community and volunteers.

Duration

2 years (November 2015 - November 2017)

3) "This is my voice"

Brief description

It is about making loud and public the silent voices of 40 hard of hearing youngsters from Poland and Romania through the Photo Voice methodology. The authors of the photos exhibited are 40 young Deaf people from Romania and Poland, who, through photography, express problems, opinions, needs, trying to communicate with the hearing persons. Involved in a training programme in their own country, working in parallel, the 40 youngsters will programme using photo voice methodology to learn to express their needs and ideas in relation with society.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

After an intense Photo voice training in the cities of origin, the 40 young people involved in the project meet in Bucharest for a 4-day workshop. The best pictures created by young participants during the project were included in a traveling exhibition, which toured Bucharest, Craiova, Cluj and Warsaw. Outcomes: Photo exhibitions, web platform, happenings and nonformal activities will constitute the output of the project to make the message clear to the community.

Approaches and methodologies

Photovoice blends a grassroots approach to photography and social action. It provides cameras not to health specialists, policy makers, or professionals, but to people with least access to those who make decisions affecting their lives.



Target group

Young Deaf people.

Duration

May to September 2011

4) “Good deeds become colorful!”

Brief description

A painting camp that was organised at the Tismana Monastery, in Gorj County. Here, 20 young people, 10 hearing impaired and 10 pupils and students, guided by teachers from the Faculty of Theology of Craiova, Sacred Art Section, made paintings in nature, inspired by the picturesque landscapes. Their works were brought to the Centre for Restoration and Visualization of the Faculty of Theology of Craiova, and will later be exhibited in the most important places of the region. A gala auction was organised, with the money earned to be directed to children with hearing impairments.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

Outdoor art camp. Outcomes: exhibit with the works painted by children.

Approaches and methodologies

The mixed group formed by Deaf and hearing children promotes inclusion and supports empowering Deaf children through artistic activities. The outdoor camp helps develop social skills, communication skills, creativity, social integration skills.

Target group

20 children: 10 hearing, 10 Deaf.

Duration

October 2015.

5) “We hear only via colours”

Brief description

Creating opportunities for students in partner schools to facilitate communication using the language of art. The pupils who took part in this project had a chance to



express themselves in an artistic field with the pupils who were at the same age and to improve their self-confidence.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

Exhibitions and CDs with content related to the project theme; Paintings in partner schools; The world in images and colour - the realisation in partnership of paintings that symbolise different themes or messages on the walls of the host schools at the project meetings.

Approaches and methodologies

Children painted the walls of the school, which are the only witnesses to their silence, making hearing pupils and the hearing-impaired pupils socialise. These walls were coloured with feelings, thoughts, culture and common art language. Each pupil became a colour to enable them to speak and hear with art.

Target group

Deaf and hearing pupils from the partner schools.

Duration

01.08.2011 - 31.07.2013



FROM SLOVAKIA

From the context analysis carried out in Slovakia, a low number of interesting practices concerning the services offered by museums to Deaf people are highlighted, as well as some projects focused on the involvement of Deaf people in the field for art education. For this reason, some good practices implemented in other European countries (Netherlands and UK) have been included in the research.

The main objectives of the projects selected was to analyse the context of the situation of young Deaf people in the cultural-artistic field. This analysis included identifying relevant objectives for the Deaf community, such as: increasing the interaction of the museum between the Deaf people and the public and bringing its services into line with best practice in this field; improving the quality of life of the Deaf; helping to integrate young Deaf people into the community and the labour market; and preventing the social marginalisation of Deaf people.

The following difficulties were encountered: a bad description of some projects, a long wait for answers when communicating electronically. It should be noted that seven Deaf guides in Russia, France, Brazil, Czech Republic were interested in working with the MADE partnership, but were unable to provide detailed information in time.

1) “Tripolitana “Regional Museum in Prešov” - Slovakia

Brief description

It has been established and managed by the Prešov Self-governing Region, as its budgetary organisation. Tripolitana is a young and old museum: young in its new form of museum in the three cities of Eastern Slovakia, old in the history of its parts and in the antiquity of its objects. Tripolitana consists of two originally independent museums - the Regional Museum in Prešov with its branch in Stropkov and the Homeland Museum in Hanušovce nad Topľou, whose area of interest was the district of Vranov.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

The Slovak Sign Language videos exhibition is available on YouTube; users need to scan the QR code to watch the videos. The Deaf guide offers an explanation that is normally offered to all visitors, and the videos also contain interpretations pertaining to individual exposures. In this way, the museum is open to a wider range of visitors. For Deaf visitors, it is necessary to gradually scan the QR codes with the tablet. The Deaf can also use their own phones and other devices equipped with a code reader. It



is also possible to book a tour with a Slovak Sign Language interpreter, but the request must come from the visitors. Since the introduction of the Sign Language video guide, the number of Deaf visitors has increased.

Approaches and methodologies

Visitors need to have their own smartphone or borrow a tablet from the museum. The smartphone needs to have some applications that can read QR code. After scanning, the QR code opens video in the Slovak Sign Language.

Target group

Deaf peoples and Sign Language users

Duration

The exhibition for accessibility opened in December 2017 - 4 and half hour tour.

2) Deaf Majo TV – history guide – Slovakia

Brief description

It is designed for Deaf people interested in history. Videos are in Slovak Sign Language. Each video is focused on a specific historical event, theme, historical personality, or history of a particular place, city, castle, chateau, mansion, or church. The videos were shot directly on location, in the Slovak and Czech Republics in particular. The videos are presented by a tourist guide who shows, explains and accompanies Deaf people in interesting places in Slovak history.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

The filmed material is gradually being processed and posted on Deaf Majo TV YouTube channel. There are 20 subscribers and more than 5000 views so far. Non-subscribers are notified via the social network about adding a new video, e.g. Facebook resp. groups on FB (Entertainment for the Deaf). Feedback to videos is mostly positive.

Approaches and methodologies

The topics for the videos are chosen based on the current situation or locations visited by the staff organisation.

The information available for the Deaf is obtained from several sources: by studying historical literature, from websites or directly from guides who accompany the staff organisation when visiting a particular historical monument. The recorded material will be then processed and published on YouTube.



Target group

Videos are for all ages of Deaf people.

Duration

May 2017 / more than 50 videos have been added.

3) Dennis Hoogeveen “The Groninger Museum” - Netherland

Brief description

It is a museum dedicated to modern arts and offer various exhibitions, approximately 2-3 times per year. Since May 2018, the Museum has been offering Sign Language tours once per month.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

There are different kind of tours, but mostly it is a 1.5-hour tour, with 1 hour for one exhibition and 30 minutes for another exhibition, depending what is needed. It is one time per month, always on the first Saturday of the month.

Approaches and methodologies

Before each major exhibition, visitors receive a training by the own contact person from the department of Education of the museum who takes to the visitors through the museum and explains the main attractions of the exhibition. Visitors are encouraged to read the papers and lesson plans about the exhibition and museum.

Target group

Deaf peoples and Sign Language users.

Duration

Twice annually, they offer tours with Sign Language interpreters so Deaf people can bring their families and friends who are hearing and cannot use Sign Language.



4) John Wilson – BSL talks and tours – UK

Brief description

John Wilson is a freelance British Sign Language (BSL) tour guide and he carries out the core activity in museums and art galleries, delivering talks and tours to groups of Deaf people on collections and exhibitions. Support activities include:

1. promoting access to arts and heritage for Deaf people through medium of BSL in new institutions across UK;
2. persuading institutions to expand and improve Deaf access programmes through use of Deaf guides using BSL, without interpreters, where possible;
3. encouraging employment of Deaf people by mainstream institutions in arts and heritage sector;
4. promoting interest in and take-up of arts and heritage in Deaf community;
5. supporting projects to enable Deaf people to acquire skills to provide high-quality BSL tours and talks in arts and heritage sector;
6. increasing awareness of access needs of Deaf BSL-users.

Implemented activities and final outcomes

- Ongoing delivery of tours and talks in high profile institutions (Royal Academy, Tate Galleries, National Gallery, Windsor Castle, RAF Museum and many more): hundreds now delivered over a period of 14 years.
- Ongoing effort to raise awareness of institutions and establish new BSL tours – e.g. D-Day Museum /Portsmouth/; London Wetland Trust.
- Supporting and advising on special programmes to engage Deaf BSL-users in arts and heritage – e.g. National Maritime Museum (reminiscence work, BSL drama) and Wallace Collection (hands-on artwork).
- Supporting and advising programmes to recruit and train Deaf guides (Tate Gallery, Royal Collection Enterprises).
- Establishment of a UK-wide web-based information resource for BSL talks and tours, via Facebook – this resource in no. 2 on list generated by Google search “BSL talks and tours”.
- Curating year-long programme of BSL talks at Royal Academy (two years running) – in 2018/19 organising a programme delivered by Deaf women BSL guides. Involvement in research and development work to raise understanding of access needs and Deaf and disabled visitors to arts and heritage and to share good practice.



Approaches and methodologies

Focus on high quality provision and good organisation e.g. ensuring that where interpreters are engaged to voice-over BSL tours that they are adequately prepared and can provide high quality support. Promotion of BSL as best medium both for delivery of information to Deaf community and to encourage their engagement in arts and heritage offer of major institutions. Supporting institutions in understanding and meeting access needs of Deaf BSL users' provision of easy to understand web-based information. Provision of good quality accurate information to Deaf audiences and potential audiences (names of guides and interpreters etc.). Engagement of Deaf people on one-to-one basis to encourage and enable their participation in access programmes "hand-holding". Participation in partnership projects to learn and share good practice in this field visits to Norway, France.

Target group

Deaf BSL-users as potential consumers of arts and heritage.

Deaf BSL-users as potential BSL guides.

Arts and heritage institutions.

Duration

Ongoing



4. MAIN FINDINGS

In this section, the main findings in terms of strengths and weaknesses of the collected good practices, competences about art disciplines and communication skills, and innovative approaches to engage Deaf youth in art training identified at transnational level have been summarised.

The results from this section will represent one of the basic elements that will form the MADE educational model developed within IO2.

4.1 Main strengths and weaknesses

The main **strengths** of the selected good practices at transnational level, are basically divided into two areas: services and activities offered by museums to Deaf people for fostering their social inclusion, and training activities aimed at helping Deaf youth to learn about art and become museum guides, mediators, or accompanying persons in order to have more working opportunities.

1. *Services offered by museums*

- ✓ Video in national Sign Language available on museum website, via free downloadable apps or QR code that Deaf people can look using own smartphone/tablet. Some videos have the subtitles in the national language which may be of benefit to Deaf people who do not know Sign Language.
- ✓ Guided tours with Sign Language interpretation addressed to both Deaf and hearing audience.
- ✓ Inclusive tours for Deaf and hearing visitors providing interactive activities that allow cultural exchanges between the different cultures.
- ✓ Cooperation with Deaf associations for promoting museum services addressed to the Deaf community so to increase the number of Deaf visitors and their involvement in cultural activities.
- ✓ Involvement of Deaf associations in the development of cultural services addressed to Deaf audience.

2. *Educational Training*

- ✓ Specific training courses addressed to young Deaf people to become mediators, on topics related to the cultural heritage and its territory, and to each cultural good's history. The training is carried out directly at museums' premises, making them pro-active collaborators in the implementation of accessibility services.



- ✓ Creation of a dictionary of terms (in Sign Language) related to art, history and culture so as to allow the Deaf people to understand and communicate notions related to art and culture using their first language.
- ✓ Artistic activities and workshops (in the field of pottery, painting, photography, etc.) as innovative approach and methodology for promoting cultural inspiration in young Deaf people, often combined with computerised technologies.

On the other hand, there were relevant **weaknesses** arising from the good practices analysed, underlining the fact that there is still much work to do to promote and increase the social and working inclusion of the Deaf people in the cultural and artistic field. The main weaknesses identified are as follows:

- ✓ Limited number of museum employees who know Sign Language able to accompany the visiting Deaf people at any time at the museum.
- ✓ Access to the guided tours with Sign Language interpretation is often on request only and must be prebooked.
- ✓ Lack of interaction for Deaf visitors during the visit at the museums that offer only videos in Sign Language.
- ✓ Lack of sufficient funds to pay for museum guides who have the necessary skills in order to transfer the art and cultural topics to Deaf visitors, or to train Deaf people to become museum guides.
- ✓ Lack of awareness of Deaf people about the need for development in the fields of culture and art.
- ✓ The information about services addressed to Deaf communities is not sufficiently disseminated and promoted on museum websites and via other channels. The poor promotion of access for the Deaf in the museum limits the number of Deaf beneficiaries.

4.2 Summary of competences about art disciplines and communication skills

From the analysis of good practices identified by the partnership, there are several competences considered relevant and necessary in order to support young Deaf people in the process of acquiring artistic knowledge for their working inclusion as museum guide or mediator.



The person who will be trained as museum guide shall have both linguistic competences (Sign Language, but also spoken national language) and expertise in art, culture and history subjects. Actually, the use of Sign Language alone is not enough: a Deaf museum guide should be able to combine knowledge of the art works and knowledge of the first language of the respective Deaf community.

Some relevant necessary competences for training young Deaf people to become mediators or guides in museum are as follows:

- to be able to prepare a description of art works in Sign Language, including their history, characteristics and cultural context;
- to use digital skills for producing videos in Sign Language, video blog, video guide posts;
- to be able to define techniques and strategies for designing museum services accessible to Deaf people in cooperation together with museum institutions and Deaf associations;
- to use Sign Language properly;
- to be able to describe each art work using the correct artistic terms in Sign Language so as to adequately convey the meaning and emotions of art works to Deaf visitors;
- specific communication skills to be used within the Deaf community.

The involvement of organisations operating in artistic and cultural fields, together with public schools, special schools for the Deaf, and Deaf associations will be needed during the process of development of the educational model aimed at helping Deaf youth to become museum guides. In addition, trained Deaf guides who already conduct tours in museum institutions could be involved in the training course implemented by MADE partners, in order to increase the interest of young Deaf people in this new opportunity for their working inclusion.

4.3 The innovative approaches to engage Deaf youth in art training

The main innovative approaches suggested by the partners at the end of the context analysis, in order to make able Deaf youth to learn about art, are as follows:

- theoretical contents on cultural heritage combined with practical training in museum settings;



- promotion of the cultural identity of the Deaf, including specific approaches such as storytelling, visual vernacular, Deaf music, pantomime training useful for acquiring self-confidence, expressive skills, assertive expression, clarity of interpretation, etc
- learning by doing;
- use of digital tools;
- role plays with reference to communication skills in specific situations (e.g. during a tour of the museum);
- involvement of Deaf leaders who have experience of museum and cultural activities.

It will be important to ensure an inclusive approach, which enables the inclusion of Deaf and hearing people, both at working and social level.

Furthermore, the cooperation between museum institutions and Deaf associations will be as essential for the promotion of the museum services addressed to Deaf people, as members of the Deaf community themselves.



5 CONCLUSIONS

The context analysis carried out by the partner organisations in six countries showed a large variety of services, activities and methodologies to enable Deaf youth to learn about art and to increase the engagement of Deaf audiences in the museums and in cultural activities.

Although in recent times, the awareness of issues related to Deaf accessibility in the field of cultural has increased, as well as projects and specific services, most of these initiatives are poorly promoted and not easily accessible to the Deaf visitors. In all the partner countries, the services offered by the museums for Deaf visitors are very few and the existing ones consist mainly of videos in Sign Language (sometimes with subtitles in the spoken national language) that can be downloaded with special apps or through QR code, and guided tours with Sign Language interpretation.

The lack of funds for the training of museum employees, that are specialised in Sign Language and who know the Deaf community culture, does not allow for an adequate social inclusion of the Deaf people in the cultural field.

Moreover, these services are not well promoted on museum websites, consequently, there is little or no growth in the knowledge of the opportunities open to the Deaf people for learning about art.

In this analysis, partners selected not only museums that offer specific services to Deaf audiences, but also projects already implemented that include training activities. These activities support Deaf people and enable them to become protagonists of the art itself; becoming mediators/facilitators inside the museums; existing programmes or courses in terms of teaching art and culture appreciation to Deaf people; activities based on digital and technological methodologies (recording of video, film, etc...); artistic activities based on the art therapy as method for promoting culture inspiration. All this shows there is a wide range of content, methodologies and approaches that can be used to teach art and culture appreciation to Deaf people, aimed at enhancing their inclusion in the social life of the hearing community in order to reduce the gap between the two worlds.

In conclusion, in order to successfully develop the MADE educational model according to the project objectives, the following competences, methodologies and approaches are essential:



- Blended training programme which combines theoretical part (to carry out in classroom through face-to-face workshops) and practical experience in the museum scenario
- Dialogical approach
- Use of Sign Language
- Digital skills and use of computerised-technologies for the production of videos
- Learning by doing
- Preparation in a team (interdisciplinary)
- Consultative and participatory process (partnership of equals) engaging Deaf youth at all levels
- Empowerment of communication skills through role-playing
- Become familiar with the vocabulary related to the language of art, which is often difficult for Deaf people to access and understanding.
- Topics related to art - general, not detailed - because a person who is not familiar with these subjects will have difficulty in transferring knowledge
- Making contacts with Deaf Artists who can provide valuable information in the form of joint recordings on specific topics related to art
- To be able to prepare a translation from text to Sign Language according to the content of ideas so that the translation is correct and reliable
- Provide trainers with all necessary materials and training: creative education requires creative teaching
- Promote creative and cooperative partnerships with museums.

It will be essential to develop the MADE educational model working closely with the Deaf community, through local associations, in order to create a useful, sustainable and exploitable product addressed to the main target group of the project.